

Elton-Chalcraft, Sally ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3064-7249> (2025)
Values and national identity: challenges for marginalised religious communities:
UK and India 2025 (Kolkata). In: Kolkata Talk, 7 March 2025, Bishop's College,
Kolkata, India. (Unpublished)

Downloaded from: <https://insight.cumbria.ac.uk/id/eprint/9085/>

Usage of any items from the University of Cumbria's institutional repository 'Insight' must conform to the following fair usage guidelines.

Any item and its associated metadata held in the University of Cumbria's institutional repository Insight (unless stated otherwise on the metadata record) may be copied, displayed or performed, and stored in line with the JISC fair dealing guidelines (available [here](#)) for educational and not-for-profit activities

provided that

- the authors, title and full bibliographic details of the item are cited clearly when any part of the work is referred to verbally or in the written form
- a hyperlink/URL to the original Insight record of that item is included in any citations of the work
- the content is not changed in any way
- all files required for usage of the item are kept together with the main item file.

You may not

- sell any part of an item
- refer to any part of an item without citation
- amend any item or contextualise it in a way that will impugn the creator's reputation
- remove or alter the copyright statement on an item.

The full policy can be found [here](#).

Alternatively contact the University of Cumbria Repository Editor by emailing insight@cumbria.ac.uk.

**Values and National
identity –
Challenges for
Marginalised religious
communities
UK and India 2025
Bishop's College Kolkata
Dr Sally Elton-Chalcraft
Professor of Social
Justice in Education**

cumbria.ac.uk

Research questions

UK

How can we understand how different groups 'view' Muslims?
(UK governmental security forces ;
local people; teachers)



How can we understand
'Muslimness' and its inherent
complexities in UK?

India

- How can we understand how different groups 'view' Christians?
- How can we understand **'Christianness'** and its inherent complexities in different Indian states?

PROJECT



VALUES AND NATIONAL
IDENTITY



What are the challenges for
marginalised religious
communities in education:



Muslims in the UK



Christians in India

PROJECT TITLE: Values and National Identity in Education – Indian Context

WHAT IS THE PURPOSE OF THE PROJECT?

This project is part of a larger study looking at values and national identity in education in two countries. The first study looked at how government educational policy in England impacted negatively on Muslims. This second study asks what lecturers, teachers and parents think about Christian values in India. Between mid February and mid March 2025 the researcher will talk with teachers, lecturers and students in 4 capital cities in different Indian states, namely Bengaluru (Karnataka), Hyderabad (Telangana), Kolkata (West Bengal) and Shillong (Meghalaya).



Sections

1. Problem of viewing Muslims as a homogenous community
2. Concept of 'suspect community' and its ascription to Muslims
3. Blaming the 'Muslim Community' for terrorist acts
4. Implications of being a 'suspect community'
5. Typology of Muslims as a suspect community
 - a) Shamima Begum perceived as a terrorist 'bad Muslim'
 - b) Hamida perceived as a 'bad Muslim'
 - c) Nadiya British Bake off champion 'good' Muslim
6. 'Least Muslim role' v perceived Muslim violent extremist
7. Implications for the RE educationalist



Shamima Begum

2015



2023

<https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2024/2/23/shamima-begum-loses-appeal-against-removal-of-british-citizenship>

<https://www.walesonline.co.uk/news/uk-news/shamima-begum-now-ex-isis-28690783>

University of
Cumbria



LED Research Centre

Learning, Education and Development



Hamida

– non hijab to hijab –

(Abbas 2019)



<https://ifyokoye.com/2011/04/21/hijab-less-by-choice-muslim-women-in-their-own-words/>



Nadya Hussain British bake off champion 2015

<https://www.nadiyahussain.com/about-me/>

1. Problem of viewing Muslims as a community

1. Interviews with 42 MPs, civil servants, Muslim civil society actors and faith leaders - ***atmosphere of hostility*** has emerged towards Muslim representation' (Jones et al 2015, p. 207).
2. concept of Muslim representation is unhelpful, it is argued, because *there is no 'Muslim community' to be represented* –
3. Accusations against the **MCB** - simplistic stigmatisation of being 'Islamist- infused' secretive agenda ... Muslim civil society organisations treated as 'toxic'; privileging the perspectives of religious ... voices of women and young peopleunheard (Jones et al 2015)
4. **Quilliam** heavily funded by successive governments to target Muslim extremism and yet went into liquidation in April 2021 with very little media attention (Ahmed 2021). handmaiden of 'Big Society' conservatism before gradually devolving into an extension of pro-Trump lobbies'
5. '**conveyor belt**' **theory of radicalisation**, moving from 'grievance, through radicalisation, to violence had been called into question with undue weight given to 'ideological factors' (Ahmed 2021);

2. Concept of 'suspect community' and its ascription to Muslims

1. Muslims viewed as a suspect community not because they are all under direct legal surveillance but because they all feel they are viewed suspiciously. Pantaziz and Pemberton (2011)
2. examples of self-mistrust among families and communities eg -
 - Welpby (2018, p. 371) - 'cultural pathologizing'
 - Abbas (2019, p. 8) 'pathologised constructions' parents spy on their children and are in conflict, feeling both 'proud yet fearful of their daughter's religiosity'.
 - Heath-Kelly (2017) - a medical model the epidemiological imaginations of radicalisation

3. Blaming the 'Muslim Community' for terrorist acts

1. Muslims become a fantasy product of the securitised imagination.... an over estimation of risk (Breen-Smyth 2014, p. 232)
2. the judge who described a woman, Umm Ahmed, as a 'good' Muslim woman who was not guilty of any illegality and yet he nevertheless sentenced her to a '12-month prison term for possessing the magazine *Inspire* which she had been reading to understand her charged brother's case.' While not sharing her brother's ideology she was subjected to a de-radicalisation programme (2015). Quereshi argues that such de-radicalisation narratives particularly in 'schools, universities and hospitals has led to the criminalisation of large sections of the various Muslim communities in the UK'
3. Wendy Brown Brown calls the 'dark others' who are 'metonymically associated with each other' and as a collective group signal the 'presence of barbarism, liberalism's putative opposite' (Brown 2006, p.172).

4 Implications of being a suspect community

1. Replace Us and them binary - Brown calls for a liberalism which is 'less invested in the absolute and dangerous opposition between us and them' in favour of a liberalism which is 'more modest and restrained in its imperial and colonial impulses' (2006:175). Brown questions whether democracy is always 'destined to be captured and co-opted by the socially dominant' (2017:203) with equality overthrown by market forces resulting in winners and losers.
2. O'Donnell (2018) in her research which charts the way in which vulnerability is conceptualized and those who are regarded at risk of radicalisation are positioned as vulnerable and requiring intervention. A therapeutic/epidemiological language is used to describe interventions, with the use of terms 'such as contagion, immunity, resilience, grooming, virus, susceptibility, therapy, autonomy, vulnerability and risk—a constellation of images/concepts resonant with therapeutic and epidemiological theories and practices' (O'Donnell 2018). She claims that when students, teachers and parents feel that their voice is not heard this leads to testimonial injustice and positions Muslims as a suspect community with 'hermeneutical injustice' (O'Donnell 2018).

5. Typology

The 'Prevent effect' positions Muslims as a suspect community

Three stances towards Muslims –

- Security forces
- Fearful people,
- Tolerant people

Three 'types' of Muslim

- Perceived terrorist ('bad' Muslim)
- Potential terrorist ('bad' Muslim)
- Harmless ('good' Muslim)

Abbas (2019) Kundnani (2015) Pantaziz and Pemberton (2011)

	Perceived as a terrorist (violent extremist)	Perceived as a potential terrorist ('bad' /extremist Muslim)	Perceived as harmless (‘good’ Muslim)
Suspicious of/ zero tolerance towards extremist views : Security forces and government	1 Incarceration and zero tolerance towards violent extremist Muslims	4 Anti radicalisation and suspicion of extremist/’bad’ Muslims	7 Use ‘good’ Muslims to ‘win hearts and minds’ of ‘suspect’ Muslim community .
Fearful of extremist views: - Muslim and non Muslim communities	2 Surveillance and referral of perceived violent extremists to security forces	5 Suspicious of extremist views and ‘bad’ Muslims Preventing violent extremism	8 Toleration ‘good’ Muslims who assimilate into secular society.
Tolerant towards extremist views:- Muslim and non-Muslim communities	3 Countering violent extremism Aware of devastating effects of violent terrorists Being Muslim is only one aspect of identity	6 Facilitate communities of disagreement to explore extremism Consider counter terrorism initiatives as counterproductive	9 Trust and respect diverse Muslim identity

'Bad' Muslim



- Shamima Begum

- 2015



- 2023

- <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2024/2/23/shamima-begum-loses-appeal-against-removal-of-british-citizenship>
- <https://www.walesonline.co.uk/news/uk-news/shamima-begum-now-ex-isis-28690783>

Bad muslim – Wendy Brown

Wendy Brown (2006, p.44). discusses marginalised, relatively homogenous groups where the object of tolerance is not the group but individuals who carry the group identity. She argues that children are 'taught' to tolerate neither groups nor individuals but 'rather, subjects carrying what the sociologists call ascriptive identities..... cast as significant enough to provoke the rejection or hostility that makes tolerance necessary' (Brown 2006, p.45). The typology seeks to capture attitudes towards these three women seen as individuals who carry the group identity of 'Muslims as a suspect community' and reified 'othering' of two of the women who are explicitly seen as 'different'.

Zero tolerance positions Shamima as a 'foreign, erroneous, objectionable or dangerous element' threatening to destroy the 'host' as Brown's discussion of tolerance indicates (2006:27). Brown describes the use of 'tolerance' in a range of contexts – plant physiology, medicine, policing and engineering all of which reveal the extent to which the 'host' is able to tolerate what is foreign or strange and how it can endure what is 'patently toxic' (2006, p.26)

Suspected 'bad' Muslim, (potential terrorist)

- Hamida (Abbas
2015)



- <https://ifyokoye.com/2011/04/21/hijab-less-by-choice-muslim-women-in-their-own-words/>

6. 'Least Muslim' role



- Nadya Hussain British bake off champion 2015
- 'Least Muslim' role
- <https://www.nadiyahussain.com/about-me/>

6. Least Muslim role

Nadiya the 'good' Muslim - 'least Muslim role'

even the 'good' Muslims cannot fully shed the 'stigma of their difference' (Brown 2006: 76, 77).

Nadiya, the 'good' Muslim, in comparison with Shamima the violent extremist continuum between acceptability and rejection.

Even Hamida is part of the 'suspect' community because her views are considered extremist by her own family 'bad' Muslim. (Abbas 2019)

typology = range of perceptions (does not capture the nuances)

typology = range of views by a range of people belonging to a variety of organisations and walks of life

security forces' agenda to identify terrorists = YES appropriate behaviour in their NOT appropriate in education

The diagram consists of two large blue arrows pointing towards each other. The left arrow contains the text '7. Implications for RE community'. The right arrow contains the text 'What can teachers do? :' followed by a bulleted list of three items: 'Thoroughly understand the issues/ problems', 'Openly engage in professional development alongside others', and 'Bravely advocate equitable learning and teaching'.

7. Implications for RE community

What can teachers do? :

- **Thoroughly understand** the issues/ problems
- **Openly engage** in professional development alongside others
- **Bravely advocate** equitable learning and teaching



1. Thoroughly understand the issues

An example : The problems with the Prevent Policy

The 'Prevent effect' positions Muslims as a suspect community

Three stances towards Muslims –

- Security forces
- Fearful people,
- Tolerant people

Three 'types' of Muslim

- Perceived terrorist ('bad' Muslim)
- Potential terrorist ('bad' Muslim)
- Harmless ('good' Muslim)

Abbas (2019) Kundnani (2015) Pantazis and Pemberton (2011)

Doing Research that matters : Vision and Aims of our Education Research Centre

- *To help to dismantle disadvantage and promote social justice by utilizing our time and expertise to engage in purposeful educational research grounded in practice.*



Muslims described as a 'suspect community'

- Peer reviewed
- article
- 2024

Home ► All Journals ► Journal of Beliefs & Values ► List of Issues ► Latest Articles ► Muslims as a suspect community: a typolo ...

 **Journal of Beliefs & Values** >
Studies in Religion & Education
Latest Articles

Enter keywords, authors, DOI, etc

This Journal ▼
Advanced

[Submit an article](#) [Journal homepage](#)

203
Views

0
CrossRef
citations to date

1
Altmetric

  Listen 

Research Article

Muslims as a suspect community: a typology to support classroom discussions

Sally Elton-Chalcraft  & Hazel Bryan

Received 24 Jan 2024, Accepted 29 Oct 2024, Published online: 26 Nov 2024

 Cite this article  <https://doi.org/10.1080/13617672.2024.2428116>  Check for updates

[Full Article](#) [Figures & data](#) [References](#) [Citations](#) [Metrics](#) [Licensing](#) [Reprints & Permissions](#)

Related research 

4TH
EDITION

PROFESSIONAL STUDIES IN PRIMARY EDUCATION

EDITED BY HILARY COOPER & SALLY ELTON-CHALCRAFT



ROUTLEDGE

Teaching Religious and Worldviews Education Creatively

Edited by Sally Elton-Chalcraft

LEARNING TO TEACH IN THE PRIMARY SCHOOL SERIES

2nd
Edition



References

- Abbas, M. (2019) 'I grew a beard and my dad flipped out!' Co-option of British Muslim parents in countering 'extremism' within their families in Bradford and Leeds, *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 45:9, 1458-1476, DOI: [10.1080/1369183X.2018.1466694](https://doi.org/10.1080/1369183X.2018.1466694)
- Brown, W. (2006) *Regulating Aversion : Tolerance in the Age of Identity and Empire* Princeton: Princeton University Press Brown, W. (2019) *In the Ruins of Neoliberalism*. Columbia University Press Brown, W. (2020) *Undoing the Demos: Neoliberalism's Stealth Revolution*. Princeton: Princeton University Press
- Bryan, H., Revell, L. and Elton-Chalcraft, S. (2018) Counter terrorism Law and Education : student teachers' induction into Prevent Duty through the lens of Bauman's Liquid Modernity In Trimmer, K, Dixon, R. and Findlay, Y., eds *The Palgrave Handbook of Education Law for schools– Considering the Legal Context of Schools* Cham, Switzerland: Springer International publishing https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-3-319-77751-1_27
- Dsouza, S. (2021, June). Identity of Muslims in India as Marginalized community: Special Focus on Minorities of Gujarat State. In *I-COFFEES 2019: Proceedings of the 2nd International Conference on Fundamental Rights, I-COFFEES 2019, 5-6 August 2019, Bandar Lampung, Lampung, Indonesia* (p. 95). European Alliance for Innovation.
- Dsouza, S. (2021, June). Identity of Muslims in India as Marginalized community: Special Focus on Minorities of Gujarat State. In *I-COFFEES 2019: Proceedings of the 2nd International Conference on Fundamental Rights, I-COFFEES 2019, 5-6 August 2019, Bandar Lampung, Lampung, Indonesia* (p. 95). European Alliance for Innovation.
- Elton-Chalcraft (2024) 2nd ed *Teaching RE Creatively* Abingdon: Routledge (1st Ed 2015)
- Elton-Chalcraft and Bryan, H. (2024) Muslims as a suspect community: A typology to aid classroom discussion <https://articlegateway.com/index.php/JHETP/article/view/3130> accessed 2.06.21
- Elton-Chalcraft, S. (2020) Student teachers' diverse knowledge and experiences of religion – implications for culturally responsive teaching *Journal of Higher Education Theory and Practice*, 20 (6). pp. 35-54. Open Access available at <https://articlegateway.com/index.php/JHETP/issue/view/314> and PDF at <https://articlegateway.com/index.php/JHETP/article/view/3130> accessed 2.06.21
- Home Office (2015) *Prevent duty*. London: National Stationery Office
- Iverson, L. (2018) From safe spaces to communities of disagreement British Journal of Religious Education pgs 315-326 available online at <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/8.1080/01416200.2018.1445617> accessed 2.1.21
- Kundnani, A. (2015) *The Muslims Are Coming: Islamophobia, Extremism and the Domestic War on Terror* Verso Press
- Lockely-Scott, A. (2020) Exploring the imagined identities of Muslim Pupils in the context of Prevent. http://wrap.warwick.ac.uk/153071/1/WRAP_Theses_Lockley-Scott_2020.pdf
- Miah, S. (2017) Prevent'ing Education Anti Muslim racism and the war on terror NiB https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1057/9781137313089_8
- O'Donnell, A. (2018) Contagious ideas: vulnerability, epistemic injustice and counter-terrorism in education, *Educational Philosophy and Theory*, 50:10, 981-997, DOI: [10.1080/00131857.2016.1217187](https://doi.org/10.1080/00131857.2016.1217187)
- Pantazis, C. and Pemberton, S. (2011) Restating the case for the 'suspect community': A Reply to Greer *The British Journal of Criminology*, Volume 51, Issue 6, November 2011, Pages 1054–1062, <https://doi.org/10.1080/00131857.2011.614071>
- Thomas, P. (2020). *Britain's prevent strategy: Always changing always the same?* In Bushar & L. Jerome (Eds.), *The Prevent Duty in education* (pp. 11–31). Palgrave Macmillan.

Abbas, M. (2019) 'I grew a beard and my dad flipped out!' Co-option of British Muslim parents in countering 'extremism' within their families in Bradford and Leeds, *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 45:9, 1458-1476, DOI: 10.1080/1369183X.2018.1466694

Bryan, H., Revell, L. and Elton-Chalcraft, S. (2018) Counter terrorism Law and Education : student teachers' induction into Prevent Duty through the lens of Bauman's Liquid Modernity In Trimmer, K, Dixon, R. and Findlay, Y., eds *The Palgrave Handbook of Education Law for schools— Considering the Legal Context of Schools* Cham, Switzerland: Springer International publishing https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1007/978-3-319-77751-1_27

Elton-Chalcraft (2024) 2nd ed *Teaching Religious and Worldviews Education Creatively* Abingdon: Routledge

Elton-Chalcraft, S, Revell, L. and Lander, V. (2022) Fundamental British Values: your responsibilities, to promote or not to promote? Ch 15 In Cooper, H. and Elton-Chalcraft, S. (Eds) 4th edition *Professional Studies in Primary Education* London: Sage <https://us.sagepub.com/en-us/nam/professional-studies-in-primary-education/book273439>

Warner, D. and Elton-Chalcraft, S. (2022) Teaching for Race Culture and Ethnicity Awareness and Understanding Ch 14 In Cooper, H. and Elton-Chalcraft, S. (Eds) 4th edition *Professional Studies in Primary Education* London: Sage <https://us.sagepub.com/en-us/nam/professional-studies-in-primary-education/book273439>

Home Office (2015) *Prevent duty*. London: National Stationery Office

Kundnani, A. (2015) *The Muslims Are Coming: Islamophobia, Extremism and the Domestic War on Terror* Verso Press

Lockely-Scott, A. (2020) Exploring the imagined identities of Muslim Pupils in the context of Prevent. http://wrap.warwick.ac.uk/153071/1/WRAP_Theses_Lockley-Scott_2020.pdf

Miah, S. (2017) *Prevent'ing Education Anti Muslim racism and the war on terror* NiB https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.1057/9781137313089_8

O'Donnell, A. (2018) Contagious ideas: vulnerability, epistemic injustice and counter-terrorism in education, *Educational Philosophy and Theory*, 50:10, 981-997, DOI: 10.1080/00131857.2016.1217187

Pantazis, C. and Pemberton, S. (2011) Restating the case for the 'suspect community': A Reply to Greer, *The British Journal of Criminology*, Volume 51, Issue 6, November 2011, Pages 1054–1062, <https://doi.org/10.1093/bjc/azr071>

Thomas, P. (2020). Britain's prevent strategy: Always changing always the same? In J. Busher & L. Jerome (Eds.), *The Prevent Duty in education* (pp. 11–31). Palgrave Macmillan.

Thompson, Stephen; Rohwerder, Brigitte; Arockiasamy, Clement (2021). *Freedom of Religious Belief and People with Disabilities: A Case Study of People with Disabilities from Religious Minorities in Chennai, India*. The Institute of Development Studies and Partner Organisations. Report. <https://hdl.handle.net/20.500.12413/16709>

Selvaraj, S. (2021). *Rethinking Violence: Indian Christians, Hindutva and the Freedom of Religion in India* (Doctoral dissertation, King's College London).